

NOTRE DAME JOURNAL OF FORMAL LOGIC

Edited by

Bolesław Sobociński



VOLUME XV

1974

NOTRE DAME JOURNAL OF FORMAL LOGIC

Bolesław Sobociński, *Editor*

Managing Editor:

John Thomas Canty

Business Manager

Ann W. Lauer

Editorial Board

Ignacio Angelelli
F. Gonzalez Asenjo
Nuel D. Belnap, Jr.
Ivan Boh
William W. Boone
Karel L. de Bouvère

Robert Bull
George Goe
Hugues Leblanc
Gerald Massey
Elliott Mendelson

Marian B. Pour-El
Luis Elpidio Sanchis
Wilson E. Singletary
Vito F. Sinisi
Ivo Thomas
J. Jay Zeman

Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic is published quarterly by the University of Notre Dame in January, April, July and October of each year. The Journal is composed by Beljan, Ann Arbor, Michigan and printed by Cushing-Malloy, Inc., Ann Arbor, Michigan. Second-class postage paid at Notre Dame, Indiana 46556.

Authors should consult the "Guide to authors" for editorial information. Articles and editorial correspondence should be sent to *B. Sobociński, Editor*, P.O. Box 28, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556, U.S.A.

Subscriptions are \$16.00 per year for institutions and \$10.00 for individuals. Back volumes of the Journal may be ordered at the applicable subscription prices. Orders for subscriptions and back volumes (accompanied by payment), and changes of address should be sent to the *Business Manager*, P.O. Box 5, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556, U.S.A.

Copyright © 1974 by the University of Notre Dame. All rights reserved.

NOTRE DAME JOURNAL OF FORMAL LOGIC

VOLUME XV, 1974 ¹¹⁶

CONTENTS

Some results and algebraic applications in the theory of higher-order ultraproducts. By <i>Wilfred G. Malcolm</i>	1
Quine on the inscrutability and relativity of reference. By <i>Michael J. Loux</i> and <i>Wm. David Solomon</i>	16
Propositional and predicate calculuses based on combinatory logic. By <i>M. W. Bunder</i>	25
Generalised logic. By <i>John Evenden</i>	35
Possibility pre-supposition free logics. By <i>Roderic A. Girle</i>	45
<i>Principia Mathematica</i> description theory: The classical and an alternative notation. By <i>Jordan Howard Sobel</i>	63
Resolution and the consistency of analysis. By <i>Peter B. Andrews</i>	73
Les propriétés du foncteur Nicod par rapport à la réciprocity et conjonction. II. By <i>Eugen Mihăilescu</i>	85
Completeness of relevant quantification theories. By <i>Robert K. Meyer</i> , <i>J. Michael Dunn</i> and <i>Hugues Leblanc</i>	97
Models of $Th(\langle \omega^\omega, < \rangle)$. By <i>John W. Rosenthal</i>	122
Partial universal decision elements. By <i>J. C. Muzio</i>	133
Some mereological models. By <i>Robert E. Clay</i>	141
S3.02=S3.03. By <i>George F. Schumm</i>	147
A note on finite intermediate logics. By <i>J. G. Anderson</i>	149
Combinatory and propositional logic. By <i>D. Meredith</i>	156
A concise method for translating propositional formulae containing the standard truth-functional connectives into a Sheffer stroke equivalent; plus an extension of the method. By <i>Ralph L. Slaght</i> . . .	161
Schematizing De Morgan's argument. By <i>R. G. Wengert</i>	165
A note on natural deduction in many-valued logic. By <i>Bruce White</i> . . .	167
Concerning the proper axioms of S4.02. By <i>Bolesław Sobociński</i>	169
McCawley and logic. By <i>T. Y. Pak</i>	173
A note on a consistency proof. By <i>Frank Fox</i>	176
A categorical equivalence of proofs. By <i>Manfred E. Szabo</i>	177
Various systems of set theory based on combinatory logic. By <i>M. W. Bunder</i>	192
Professor Quine and real classes. By <i>James K. Feibleman</i>	207
Non-assertoric inference. By <i>Robert P. McArthur</i> and <i>David Welker</i> . .	225
On referentiality and its conditions. By <i>Chung-ying Cheng</i>	245

Admissible rules, derivable rules, and extendible logistic systems. By <i>Howard C. Wasserman</i>	265
Über eine Erweiterung der algebraischen Operationen. By <i>Günther Frei-Imfeld</i>	279
A study of $\mathcal{Z}$ modal systems. By <i>R. I. Goldblatt</i>	289
K and $\mathcal{Z}$. By <i>George F. Schumm</i>	295
Ockham on self-reference. By <i>Paul Vincent Spade</i>	298
Sind die deontischen Funktoren distributiv? By <i>Bohuslav T. Peklo</i> . . .	301
Matrix calculi SS1M and SS1I compared with axiomatic systems. By <i>J. Czermak</i>	312
Boolean subtractive algebras. By <i>Thomas M. Hearne</i> and <i>Carl G. Wagner</i>	317
A strong completeness theorem for 3-valued logic. By <i>H. Goldberg</i> , <i>H. Leblanc</i> and <i>G. Weaver</i>	325
The inadequacy of Hughes and Cresswell's semantics for the CI systems. By <i>Zane Parks</i> and <i>Terry L. Smith</i>	331
Semantics for contingent identity systems. By <i>Zane Parks</i>	333
Many-one degrees associated with partial propositional calculi. By <i>W. E. Singletary</i>	335
A result of extending Bochvar's 3-valued logic. By <i>Kenneth W. Collier</i>	344
On a passage of Aristotle. By <i>Ivo Thomas</i>	347
A note on natural deduction. By <i>Alex Blum</i>	349
Deductive inferences from particular to general. By <i>Howard Pospesel</i> and <i>Charles G. Werner</i>	351
Indice de vérité, fonctions implicationnelles accessibles, recensement des thèses. By <i>Albert Sade</i>	353
Logical consequence in modal logic II: Some semantic systems for S4. By <i>George Weaver</i> and <i>John Corcoran</i>	370
Normal and skew systems. By <i>Gary Gilford Gleason</i>	379
K1 as a Dawson modelling of A. R. Anderson's sense of "ought." By <i>Charles F. Kielkopf</i>	402
Logic without tautologies. By <i>Leo Simons</i>	411
Translation of the simple theory of types into a first order language. By <i>H. Julian Wadleigh</i>	432
α -models and systems T and T* . By <i>Newton C. A. da Costa</i>	443
Gentzen systems for modal logic. By <i>Louis F. Goble</i>	455
William of Sherwood on propositions and their parts. By <i>Mary J. Sirridge</i>	462
A theorem concerning a restricted rule of substitution in the field of propositional calculi. I. By <i>Bolesław Sobociński</i>	465

On Meredith's sole positive axiom. By <i>Ivo Thomas</i>	477
The one variable implicational calculus. By <i>V. Frederick Rickey</i>	478
Ordered pairs and cardinality in New Foundations. By <i>John Lake</i>	481
A note on UDEs in an n -valued logic. By <i>T. C. Wesselkamper</i>	485
A simple proof of Herbrand's theorem. By <i>Andrés R. Raggio</i>	487
On a syntactical characterization of logical expressions. By <i>Howard Burdick</i>	489
Generalizations of the distributive and associative laws. By <i>Alan C. Wilde</i>	491
On a nonthesis of classical modal logic. By <i>Robert W. Murungi</i>	494
On a theory of inconsistent formal systems. By <i>Newton C. A. da Costa</i>	497
An analysis of the concept of constructive categoricity. By <i>Charles Francis Quinn</i>	511
Fregean semantics for a realist ontology. By <i>Nino B. Cocchiarella</i> . . .	552
Involution as a basis for propositional calculi. By <i>M. B. Smyth</i>	569
A theorem concerning a restricted rule of substitution in the field of propositional calculi. II. By <i>Bolesław Sobociński</i>	589
Satisfiability in a larger domain. By <i>R. L. Goodstein</i>	598
Incomplete models. By <i>John Grant</i>	601
Self reference in formal languages. By <i>Peter Swiggart</i>	608
A note on contrariety. By <i>George Englebrechtsen</i>	613
Aristotle and a modern notion of predication. By <i>Kwame Gyekye</i>	615
Set-valued set theory: Part one. By <i>E. William Chapin, Jr.</i>	619
Unary predicates. By <i>James Andrew Fulton</i>	635
A substitution property. By <i>Alan C. Wilde</i>	639
Description theory: Critical defense of a Russellian approach. By <i>Jean Claude Volgo</i>	641
Errata	648
Author index. II. Volumes XI-XV (1970-1974). By <i>Ann W. Lauer</i>	649

LIST OF AUTHORS

This list of authors gives a complete roster of all who have contributed articles to the *Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic*. It is arranged alphabetically in two parts, the first for Volumes I-X and the second for Volumes XI-XIV.

The list for Volumes I-X contains the names of one hundred seventy five authors: M. Anderson, I. Angelelli, F. Asenjo, E. Ashworth, J. Bacon, A. Barker, J. Barback, R. Beatty, N. Belnap, Jr., O. Bird, S. Bloom, I. Bocheński, I. Boh, D. Bollman, K. de Bouvère, C. Bredlau, D. Brignole, G. Brumm, R. Bull, T. Bynum, P. Calabrese, J. Canty, R. Carnes, A. Carpentier, C. Caton, H. Chandler, C. Cheng, L. Chiaraviglio, R. Clay, N. Cocchiarella, R. Cole, F. Coppotelli, J. Corcoran, M. Cresswell, F. Crosson, R. Doss, S. Dowdy, B. Dreben, R. Eberle, H. Enderton, T. Evans, G. Farre, H. Fast, M. Fisk, E. Foxley, W. Frascella, M. Gemignani, L. Goddard, G. Goe, A. Goetz, R. Goodstein, T. Grilliot, E. Hacker, N. Hanson, I. Heath, D. Henry, H. Hermes, A. Heyting, J. Hooley, A. Ihrig, W. Jaffe, Z. Jordan, G. Kalinowski, D. Kaplan, J. Kearns, M. Krom, G. Kùng, F. von Kutshera, K. Lambert, L. Larouche, A. Lauer, H. Leblanc, R. Lee, C. Leininger, C. Lejewski, E. Lemmon, S. Liu, K. Loewen, C. Lyngholm, J. Mackie, J. Markham, G. Massey, S. McCall, S. McCleary, C. McKay, T. McLaughlin, E. Mendelson, K. Menger, C. Meredith, E. Mihăilescu, J. Minichiello, R. Montague, A. Moreno, A. Mullin, J. Myhill, W. Nemitz, H. Nielsen, W. O'Briant, K. Ohashi, W. Parry, C. Parsons, M. Partis, T. Patton, P. Perkins, R. Peters, H. Pogorzelski, A. Prior, R. Purtill, H. Putnam, A. Raggio, G. Rainich, J. Reichbach, M. Rennie, N. Rescher, M. Resnik, T. Ristea, F. Rivetti Barbo, J. Rosenberg, R. Routley, H. Rubin, J. Rubin, S. Saito, L. Sanchis, K. Sayre, T. Scharle, R. Schock, M. Schultz, G. Schumm, S. Sehgal, J. Seldin, A. Shukla, Sibajiban, W. Sierpiński, J. Sikora, L. Simons, W. Singletary, V. Sinisi, F. Sioson, H. Skala, T. Skolem, T. Smiley, B. Sobociński, C. de Renna e Souza, W. Stegmüller, H. Stopes-Roe, P. Strauss, S. Summersbee, R. Suszko, A. Sweet, D. Székely, I. Thomas, R. Thomason, R. Tompkins, J. Trentman, A. Trew, R. Tursman, F. Tytus, J. Ullian, R. Vesley, V. Vučković, J. Vuillemin, A. Walters, G. Weaver, P. Weingartner, K. Weston, W. Wilcox, H. Williams, W. Wisdom, J. Woods, C. Works, J. Wu, M. Yntema, W. Yourgrau, H. Zassenhaus, J. Zeman.

The list for Volumes XI-XV contains the names of those authors who contributed an article for the first time. There were one hundred seventy eight new authors: A. Abian, R. Ackermann, J. Anderson, P. Andrews, C. Applebaum, R. Applebee, R. Baxter, W. R. Belding, D. Bennett, J. Berry, J. H. Blackhurst, A. Blum, G. Boolos, M. Bradley, R. Brady, A. Bullock, M. Bunder, A. Bundy, H. Burdick, H. Byerly, R. Call, J. Cargile, E. W. Chapin, T. Chapman, J. Chidgey, K. Collier, G. Collins, N. da Costa, R. Cowen, J. Czermak, I. Dapunt, J. Dekker, T. Denise, J. Donnelly, K. Döpp, D. Dorrough, A. Dou, J. Drabbe, A. Dumitriu, J. Dunn, E. Ellentuck, G. Englebreetsen, W. Essler, J. Evenden, P. Facione, J. Feibleman, K. Fine, M. Fitting, P. FitzPatrick, L. Foss, F. Fox, G. Frei-Imfeld, J. Fulton, P. Gärdenfors, J. Garson, F. Gass, H. Gensler, N. Georgieva, G. Germano, J. Gersting, M. Ginsberg, R. Girle, M. Gladstone, G. Gleason, L. Goble, H. Goldberg, R. Goldblatt, M. Goldstein, J. Grant, J. Gregg, K. Gyekye, J. Halpern, C. Hamblin, J. F. Harris, J. H. Harris, W. Hart, S. Hayes, A. Hazen, T. Hearne, T. Hecht, H. Hiž, M. Hocutt, C. Hoormann, C. Hughes, W. Jackson, T. Katriňák, H. Kennedy, C. Kielkopf, J. Kotelly, A. Kron, J. Lake, M. Laplaza, J. Lee, A. Lehmann, N. de Lillo, M. Loux, E. Madison, D. Makinson, W. Malcolm, R. Manor, E. Marsden, R. McArthur, J. McKean, C. Merchant, D. Meredith, R. Meyer, L. Meyers, H. Montgomery, L. Monteiro, C. Morgan, N. Moutafakis, M. Mullick, R. Murungi, J. Muzio, A. vander Nat, J. Owings, B. Pahi, T. Pak, R. Z. Parks, M. Parnes, T. Payne, B. Peklo, C. Pinter, J. Pollock, H. Pospesel, R. Poss, L. Pozsgay, C. Quinn, A. Rao, E. Rasof, R. Redmon, V. F. Rickey, F. Roberts, B. van Rootselaar, A. Roqué, S. Rosenberg, J. Rosenthal, A. Sade, P. Sagal, T. Satre, H. Schneider, H. Schott, E. Schuh, R. Setlur, M. Sirridge, R. Slaght, D. Smith, T. L. Smith, M. Smyth, D. P. Snyder, J. Sobel, W. D. Solomon, P. Spade, J. Stevenson, T. Stihl, T. Sullivan, P. Swiggart, M. Szabo, M. Tapia, R. Tax, S. Thomason, D. Ulrich, J. Volgo, H. J. Wadleigh, C. Wagner, H. Wasserman, S. M. Webb, D. Welker, P. Welsh, R. Wengert, C. Werner, T. Wesselkamper, B. White, A. Wilde, C. Williamson, J. Winnie, J. Wiredu, P. Woodruff, M. Zuckerman.

NOTRE DAME JOURNAL OF FORMAL LOGIC

Bolesław Sobociński, *Editor*

Managing Editor:
John Thomas Canty

Business Manager:
Ann W. Lauer

Guide to authors submitting articles for publication

Articles are invited for publication in the Journal which bring new results to any of the following areas: algebraic logic, classical logical systems, constructive mathematics, methodology of deductive systems, model theory, non-classical formal systems, proof theory, recursion theory, and set theory. The Journal is devoted primarily to logic and the foundations of mathematics and papers which are historical or philosophical in nature will only be considered for publication provided they employ the methods of formal logic in their exposition.

Manuscripts should be typewritten with wide margins on bond paper, using double (or triple) spacing between lines throughout (including notes and references). Particular care should be given to allow sufficient space between lines containing subscripted and superscripted symbols. Each page of the manuscript (including notes and references) should be numbered. The first page should contain the article title and author's name. The last page should contain the institutional affiliation and the exact mailing address. A concise abstract should accompany each article. Authors have full responsibility for the proper preparation of manuscripts. When the manuscript is not properly prepared it may be returned to the author for retyping; services performed by the editorial offices in this regard are properly chargeable to authors. The original copy of the manuscript should be submitted (to only one journal at a time); authors should retain one copy of everything submitted.

Footnotes should be indicated by consecutive superscript numerals and listed with wide spacing between lines at the end of the article. Footnotes may appear in print at the bottom of the appropriate pages, but should nevertheless be submitted in this form. A footnote which acknowledges a debt of the author to a foundation grant or individuals should be indicated by an asterisk.

References should be cited by consecutive numerals in square brackets and listed with wide spacing between lines at the end of the listing of footnotes.

A *list of symbols* used should be submitted with the manuscript. This list may be headed "Note to the Printer"; it should not define the symbols mathematically, but should identify them typographically. Authors should underline various types of symbols in different colors throughout the manuscript, blue for bold, red for Greek, green for Gothic and other characters. It is suggested that authors refer to back issues of the Journal for examples of the style of composition.

Proof sheets are generally given authors for correcting errors that occur in composition. However, any special composition costs arising out of an author's revision of text of an article in proof will be charged to the author.

Fifty offprints without covers of each article will be supplied free of charge. Additional offprints or covers for offprints may be purchased.

Editorial correspondence and articles should be sent to:

B. Sobociński, Editor, P.O. Box 28, Notre Dame, Indiana 46556, U.S.A.

The Journal is published quarterly by the University of Notre Dame. Subscriptions are \$16.00 per year for institutions and \$10.00 for individuals. Back volumes of the Journal may be ordered at the applicable subscription prices. Orders for subscriptions and back volumes (accompanied by payment), and changes of address should be sent to the Business Manager, P.O. Box 5, Notre Dame, Indiana, 46556, U.S.A.